

**CITY OF BETHLEHEM**

**HARB CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS**

**DATE: 4 September 2019**

**APPLICANT MUST ATTEND MEETING FOR CASE TO BE HEARD**

**Deadline for submittals is by noon, two weeks prior to the next scheduled meeting.**

Submit original plus 10 copies.

**HARB MEETING MINUTES AND SUBMISSION**

MEMBERS PRESENT

Fred Bonsall  
Derrick Clark  
Connie Glagola  
Phil Roeder  
Diana Hodgson  
Beth Starbuck  
Connie Postupack  
Marsha Fritz

VISITORS PRESENT

Dan Ault  
Cheryl A. Dougan  
Anthony Viscardi  
Charles Lieb  
Shaun Fuller  
Elke Rockwell  
Donald Rockwell  
Louis Cinquino  
Pam Boyer  
Anne Prendergast  
Cassie Rogg  
Ed Courier, Bethlehem Press

MEMBERS ABSENT

Rodman Young

STAFF PRESENT

H. Joseph Phillips, AIA, Historic Officer  
E-Mail:  
jphillips@phillipsdonovanarchitects.com

MINUTES:

There were no comments on the 7 August 2019 Minutes. The minutes were approved unanimously as submitted. The 4 September 2019 meeting of HARB was called to order by Chairperson Fred Bonsall at 4:00 pm.

**Item #1:** The owner of the property located at 251 East Church Street proposes to install a wooden fence and a wooden gate with two wood fence posts.

**Property Location:** 251 East Church Street

**Property Owner:** Madeline Peters

**Address:** [REDACTED]

**Email:** [REDACTED]

**Phone:** [REDACTED]

**Applicant:** Dan Ault

**Address:** 251 East Church Street, Bethlehem, PA 18018

**Email:** aultd2003@yahoo.com

**Phone:** 917-208-6164

**Proposed Work:** The Applicant proposes to install a six feet high by 15 feet long wooden (cedar) fence and a wooden (cedar) gate, 3 feet wide by 6 feet high, at the back of their house, along with the required four wood fence posts (4"x4" kiln-dried pressure treated) as shown in the Application. The gate latch and hinges, as well as the post caps will be black in color.

**Guideline Citation:** Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s) #9 & #10

**Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations:** No negative impact to the historic district.

**Discussion – Item #1:** The Applicant advised that the submission from last month has been revised to include a 6' high x 15' long fence between his patio and the property line adjacent to his neighbor at 253 East Church Street. The fence was not included in the previous application because he didn't think that it would be visible from the street unless you walked all of the way down the walkway between the houses. The applicant described the fence as being a cedar dog-eared fence for security and privacy. The gate will match the fence, the posts will be kiln dried & pressure treated, the hardware will be black, and the post caps will be black. Marsha Fritz asked why the gate was not perpendicular to the house. The applicant explained that there was not enough space between his house and the property line to install the gate perpendicular to the house and get a gate of useable width. The applicant further advised that there is 41 inches between the houses and 31 inches between his house and the property line. Marsha Fritz asked that the applicant flip posts to the opposite side of the fence so that the posts are on the applicant's side of the fence and away from the neighbor. Fred Bonsall read a letter submitted by neighboring property owner, Cheryl Dougan, dated 4 September 2019, a copy of which is attached to these minutes. Ms. Dougan advised that she has retained legal counsel who is

drafting a suggested Ordinance regarding placement of fences to submit to the City for consideration. Diana Hodgson asked the applicant if the gate was solely for pedestrian use or if he would be moving lawn maintenance equipment through the gate. The applicant advised that the gate was for pedestrian use only and the lawn maintenance equipment would be moved through a larger gate toward the back of the property. Diana Hodgson asked if the applicant would be able to get by with a narrower gate if it was placed perpendicular to his house. The applicant replied that the gate would only be 17 inches wide if placed perpendicular to the house and this would render it difficult to use. Marsha Fritz stated that the materials of the gate and fence, as submitted, are appropriate to and consistent with other gates and fences that have been approved by HARB, even if the angled gate is not the most attractive solution. She further stated HARB only provides opinions on the suitability of materials and that other City boards and departments deal with other issues that have been raised by Ms. Dougan. Phil Roeder stated that the angle of the gate is unfortunate, but he has visited the site and it appears that there may be no other better solution, considering the location of the house on the site and the location of doors at the rear of the home.

**The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a new fence and gate.**

**Motion:** Marsha Fritz made a motion to approve the installation of the proposed cedar fence, gate (installed on angle) and kiln dried, select, pressure treated posts, with black hardware, as shown in the Application with the following conditions.

1. The fence posts shall be installed on the Applicant's side of the fence and away from the neighbor.
2. All fence posts shall have wood caps to match the fence.
3. The fence shall be located a minimum of 6 inches from the property line.
4. The fence will be 6'-0" high and will be finished by the Applicant with a clear finish on all sides of fence, gate, and posts within one year of installation.

**Second:** Derrick Clark

**Result of vote:** The result of the vote was 6 members in favor and 2 members against (Connie Glagola and Connie Postupack) to approve installation of a new fence and gate, as per the motion. Therefore, the motion carried and was approved.

**Item #2:** The applicant/owner of the property located at 46 East Church Street proposes to remove slate roofing on a shed roof and replace the slate with GAF Slateline shingles.

**Property Location:** 46 East Church Street

**Property Owner:** Charles F. Lieb

**Address:** [REDACTED]

**Email:** [REDACTED]

**Phone:** [REDACTED]

**Applicant:** Same as above.

**Address:**

**Email:**

**Phone:**

**Proposed work:** The applicant proposes to remove slate roofing on a shed roof, at the rear of the property, and replace the slate with GAF Slateline shingles.

**Guideline Citation:** Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s) #9 & #10

**Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations:** No negative impact to the historic district.

**Discussion - Item #2:** The applicant gave an overview of their proposal to remove the slate roofing on his shed and replace the slate with GAF Slateline Shingles. The Applicant advised that the adjacent garage building on his property is constructed of concrete masonry units and has an asphalt shingle roof. Marsha Fritz asked if the building in the Application is attached to the neighbors outbuilding. The Applicant responded that his building is a few inches higher than the neighbors building and that they are not attached. Diana Hodgson asked what type of gutters where on his building. The Applicant advised that the existing gutters were half-round, galvanized gutters and would be replaced in kind. Phil Roeder advised that the slate on the existing building are flaking away and are in fact in need of replacement.

**The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the existing slate roof and replacement with GAF Slateline Shingles.**

**Motion:** Phil Roeder made a motion to approve the removal of the existing slate roofing and replacement with GAF Slateline Shingles, as shown in the Application and with the following conditions.

1. Shingle color shall be Slate Grey.
2. Appropriate hip ridge shingles shall be installed at the intersection of the roof planes.

**Second:** Connie Postupack

**Result of vote:** The vote was unanimous to approve removal of the existing slate roofing and replacement with GAF Slateline Shingles, as per the motion.

**Item #3:** The owner of the property located at 56 East Wall Street proposes to remove and replace the windows.

**Property Location:** 56 East Wall Street

**Property Owner:** Louis Cinquino

**Address:** [REDACTED]

**Email:** [REDACTED]

**Phone:** [REDACTED]

**Applicant:** Same as above.

**Address:**

**Email:**

**Phone:**

**Proposed Work:** The Applicant proposes to remove and replace the existing, original (1978), badly weathered windows on the front of the house, remove two windows on the back of the house and replace them with a set of three double hung windows, as well as, sand, patch, and paint the exterior window sills and casings. Proposed replacement windows are to be Andersen Woodwright 400 series which is consistent with the windows approved for the neighboring houses at 54 and 58 East Wall Street.

**Guideline Citation:** Secretary of Interior Standards No.(s) #9 & #10

**Evaluation, Effect on Historic District, Recommendations:** No negative impact to the historic district.

**Discussion – Item #3:** The applicant gave an overview of the proposed window removal and replacement. Applicant stated that the materials to be used will be the same as those recently approved by HARB for the adjacent home at 54 East Wall Street. The only difference is, that at the rear of the house, the applicant is proposing to remove two single windows and install a single triple window unit to mimic the layout of the bay window on the opposite side of the existing door. The new window will not extend any further, in either direction, than the existing, two, single windows. Beth Starbuck asked if the new windows would be 100% wood. Mr. Phillips advised that the Application stated that the new windows would be the same as previously approved for 54 East Wall Street and that those windows are 100% wood Andersen, Woodwright, 400 Series windows with a Fibrex coating. Beth Starbuck asked if the new triple

window on the rear of the house would be within the 2 existing single window openings and the Applicant responded in the affirmative. Marsha Fritz stated that the triple window would not be approved for the front of the house, but is acceptable on the rear of the house because it will not be visible from the street.

**The HARB agreed to recommend that the Bethlehem City Council issue a certificate of Appropriateness for the removal and replacement of the existing windows with Andersen Woodwright Series 400 windows and to sand, patch, and repaint the exterior window sills and casings.**

**Motion:**

Phil Roeder made a motion to approve the removal and replacement of the existing windows with Andersen Woodwright Series 400 windows and to sand, patch, and repaint the exterior window sills and casings with the following conditions.

1. The replacement windows will be wood and painted to match the existing windows.
2. The existing casings will be retained to the greatest extent possible and painted white. If replacement is absolutely necessary, the casings will be replaced in-kind.
3. It was noted that this residence is part of a row of residences that was constructed in 1978 and replaced an earlier school building that was located on this site. The residences are deemed contributing, but are under the cut-off for "historic" buildings as defined by the NPS and part of the original national legislation.

**Second:**

Marsha Fritz

**Result of vote:**

The vote was unanimous to approve the removal and replacement of the existing windows, as per the motion.

**Other Business:**

1. Phil Roeder advised that the owner/applicant at 105 East Market Street (Northeast Corner) was installing a previously approved fence and contacted him to inquire as to what color to paint the side of the fence that is facing the neighboring property. HARB discussed and recommended that all side of the fence be painted a color to match the Applicants home.
2. Phil Roeder advised that the owner of 458 Center Street (Herron Funeral Home) contacted him with an emergency request to replace the east and west roofs with the same materials as previously approved by HARB for the replacement of their south facing roof. This includes copper valley flashing and a built-in copper gutter. Phil Roeder stated that the existing slate roofing is probably over 100 years old and is

allowing significant water infiltration. HARB unanimously agreed to allow the emergency roof replacement of the east and west roofs as outlined above.

3. Marsha Fritz informed HARB that the mural wall located on the Walnut Street Garage has been repainted in a brick red color. HARB discussed this and did not take any exception to it.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:02 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "H. Joseph Phillips". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, looped initial "H".

H. Joseph Phillips, AIA  
Historic Officer